

CITY COUNCIL AGENDA STATEMENT



Meeting Date: September 10th, 2024

To: Honorable Mayor and Members of City Council

From: Brian Shea, Planning Director

Through: George Garrett, City Manager

Item: Resolution 2024-75, Approving The Ranking And Allocations Of The Market Rate And Affordable Residential Building Permit Allocation System (RBPAS) For Period 1, Year 33 (July 14, 2024 To January 13, 2025); And Providing For An Effective Date.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the result of all BPAS applications, Planning Staff recommends that the City Council **APPROVE** the award of two (2) Market Rate General and two (2) Market Rate Owner Occupied BPAS allocations as shown in “Attachment A” and one (1) Affordable BPAS allocations “Attachment B”.

I. BACKGROUND AND JUSTIFICATION

This evaluation report has been prepared pursuant to Chapter 107 Article 1 of the City of Marathon Land Development Regulations (the “Code”). The residential dwelling unit allocation rankings attached to this report correspond to Period 1, Year 33, as defined by the Residential Building Permit Allocation System (RBPAS). This period includes January 14, 2024 To July 13, 2024

Monroe County adopted the Rate of Growth Ordinance (#016-1992), commonly referred to as ROGO, on July 13, 1992 to implement portions of its Comprehensive Plan. The ROGO established a building permit allocation system for residential construction, for the purpose of directing and limiting growth and enabling the safe and timely evacuation of the Keys in the event of a hurricane.

The City adopted new Land Development Regulations by Ordinance 2007-03 which replaced the Rate of Growth Ordinance with the Residential Building Permit Allocation System (RBPAS).

In this, its thirty first year, the BPAS allocation system may issue up to 30 awards for residential construction within the boundaries of the City, pursuant to the agreement between the City, the Department of Economic Opportunity (DEO) and Monroe County. Of the 30 allocation awards, 80% (24) are assigned to market-rate residential units and 20% (6) are assigned to affordable housing. Applications for permits are evaluated, scored and ranked according to criteria outlined in Chapter 107 Article 1 of the City of Marathon Land Development Regulations twice a year.

To provide some remedy for the decline in building permits being issued, the City adopted Ordinance 2009-09 that called for a temporary procedure to be implemented to RBPAS. This allowed the Planning Department to create a new list from the applicants that are able and willing to move forward with an awarded allocation and pick up building permits. Temporary Procedures has sunset, however to maintain the efficiency of permitting, a similar process is followed. Rather than bringing a new list back to Council each time an owner responds to defer, the owners are asked before the list is created.

In June of 2009 City Council adopted Ordinance 2009-18, creating a “TBR Affordable Pool”. Additionally, in November of 2010, the City Council adopted Ordinance 2010-12, which would allow up to 50% of the annual allocations to be distributed to the “Administrative Relief Pool” at the City Council’s discretion and by the criteria set forth in the Ordinance.

Resolution 2022-22 amends the available allocation awards as set by Council. This resolution amends the previous Resolution 2010-18 that revised the annual allocations available.

Based upon the aforementioned MOU commercial square footage is also given out through the BPAS process. 500,000 square feet was set to be given out over the 10 year period. This amounts to 25,000 square feet every six months. New commercial development is rare, with the majority falling under commercial redevelopment. Therefore, applications for commercial BPAS are few and far between. Any commercial square footage not awarded rolls over into the next period.

II. ALLOCATION AWARDS AVAILABLE

The following allocation awards are available this period:

<u>Category</u>	<u>BPAS / Period</u>
(Market Rate)	
(a) Owner-occupied Pool	2 / period
(b) General Pool	2 / period
(Affordable)	
(c) General Affordable Pool	1 / period
(d) Community Workforce Pool	
(e) TBR Affordable Pool	
(To be granted to highest scoring allocation within the 3 pools)	
(Administrative Relief)	
(e) Administrative Relief Pool	0 / period

On January 1, 2011, the Florida Cabinet (sitting as the Administration Commission) passed Rule 28-18.400 F.A.C., which changes the roll-over procedure for building permit allocations for the City of Marathon. Per the rule:

“The number of allocations issued annually for residential development under the Residential Building Permit Allocation System (BPAS) shall not exceed a total annual unit cap of 30, plus any available unused BPAS allocations from a previous year. Unused BPAS allocations may be retained and made available only for affordable housing and Administrative Relief from BPAS year to BPAS year. Unused market rate allocations shall be available for Administrative Relief. Any unused affordable allocations will roll over to affordable housing. This BPAS allocation represents the total number of allocations for development that may be issued during a year. A BPAS year means the twelve-month period beginning on July 13. Policy 1-3.5.18 supersedes Policy 1-3.5.2 of the City of Marathon Comprehensive Plan.”

The above language has also been made part of the City of Marathon Comprehensive Plan, Policy 1-3.5.1.

III. EVALUATION AND RANKING

Staff's evaluation of the BPAS applications was performed according to the provisions of the Building Permit Allocation System; positive points were granted in compliance with the evaluation criteria contained in Section 107.09 of the City Land Development Regulations. Each allocation application was ranked based on the total number of points scored. RBPAS applications with identical scores were further ranked based on the date and time they applied for RBPAS.

The final Rankings and proposed allocations are presented in the RBPAS Allocation Resolution.

Administrative relief may be provided through the above-mentioned code section. In making a determination in review of an application for administrative relief, the City Council may:

- (a) Offer to purchase the property at its fair market value as its preferred action if the property is considered environmentally sensitive; or
- (b) Grant the applicant an allocation award for all or a number of dwelling units requested in the next succeeding allocation period or extended pro rata over several succeeding quarterly allocation periods as the preferred action for buildable properties not meeting any of the criteria in subsection (f)(1) of this section; or
- (c) Suggest or provide such other relief as may be necessary and appropriate.

IV. ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATION

The market rate applications for consideration for an allocation this Period are shown on Attachment "A". The ranking of the applications are shown on both attachments.

See Attachment A of the Resolution: Ranking of Market Rate RBPAS.

The affordable applications for consideration for an allocation this Period are shown on Attachment "B". The ranking of the applications are shown on both attachments.

See Attachment B of the Resolution: Ranking of Affordable RBPAS.

Based on the result of the BPAS System, Planning Staff recommends that the City Council **APPROVE** the award of two (2) Market Rate General and two (2) Market Rate Owner Occupied BPAS allocations as shown in "Attachment A" and one (1) Affordable BPAS allocations as shown in "Attachment B".

**CITY OF MARATHON, FLORIDA
RESOLUTION 2024-75**

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF MARATHON, APPROVING THE RANKING AND ALLOCATIONS OF THE MARKET RATE AND AFFORDABLE RESIDENTIAL BUILDING PERMIT ALLOCATION SYSTEM (RBPAS) FOR PERIOD 1, YEAR 33 (JULY 14, 2024 TO JANUARY 13, 2025); AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

WHEREAS, the City of Marathon City Council (the “City”) reviewed the market rate and affordable residential dwelling unit application rankings for Period 1, Year 33 in compliance with the RBPAS Procedures promulgated in Section 107.07 of the Land Development Regulations (the “LDRs”);

WHEREAS, the City conducted a properly advertised public hearing (the “Public Hearing”) regarding the proposed residential BPAS rankings, Period 1, Year 33 pursuant to Chapter 107 Article 1 of the LDRs.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF MARATHON, FLORIDA, THAT:

Section 1. The above recitals are true and correct and incorporated herein.

Section 2. Based upon the evidence and testimony presented by City Staff and members of the public, the City Council hereby finds:

Residential Building Permit Allocation (RBPAS)

(1) The Public Hearing was properly advertised and held, as required by law, and the Applicants and all interested parties concerned in the matter were given an opportunity to be heard; and

(2) Based upon the RBPAS Rankings shown in the staff recommendation, attached as “Attachment A” for the Market Rate RBPAS pools and “Attachment B” for the Affordable pools, the City Council awards four (4) Market Rate Residential, one (1) Affordable Residential allocation; and

(3) The remaining RBPAS Applicants will retain their relative positions in the RBPAS ranking list and will be marked as deferred in accordance with Section 107.07 of the LDRs.

Section 3. Based upon the above Findings of Fact, the City Council does hereby make the following Conclusions of Law:

1. The RBPAS applications for Period 1, Year 33 of RBPAS have been processed in accordance with Chapter 107 Article 1 of the LDRs.
2. In rendering its decision, as reflected in this Resolution, the City Council has:
 - (a) Accorded procedural due process;
 - (b) Observed the essential requirements of the law; and
 - (c) Supported its decision by substantial competent evidence of record.
3. The attached RBPAS allocations are awarded. Applicants requesting transfer of building rights as part of the provision of affordable allocations shall be required to meet the criteria established in Chapter 107,17 C, prior to the receipt of affordable allocations from the City completion of transfer of market rate residential units to other locations.

Section 4. This Resolution shall become effective immediately upon its adoption.

PASSED AND APPROVED BY THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF MARATHON, FLORIDA, THIS 10th DAY OF SEPTEMBER 2024.

THE CITY OF MARATHON, FLORIDA

Robyn Still, Mayor

AYES:
NOES:
ABSENT:
ABSTAIN:

ATTEST:

Diane Clavier, City Clerk

(City Seal)

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND LEGALITY FOR THE USE AND RELIANCE OF THE CITY OF MARATHON, FLORIDA ONLY:

Steven T. Williams, City Attorney

**Attachment A:
Ranking of BPAS Applications for Period 1 Year 33
July 14, 2024 to January 13, 2025**

RANK	ROGO/BPAS NUMBER	NAME	BPAS SCORE	DATE ENTERED	TIME ENTERED	RE NUMBER
		MARKET RATE	YEAR 33	PERIOD 1		
Market Rate General Pool						
1	BPAS-06-30	PATIBANDLA, SRIKIRAN	79	11/2/2006	4:20 PM	00366031-000300
2	BPAS-21-7	LARSEN RAYMOND	77	1/12/2021	9:00 AM	00331061-002600
3	BPAS-21-11	KEYS LUXE LIFE LLC	77	1/15/2021	10:17AM	00368450-000000
4	BPAS-21-42	Liron Gozlan	77	2/17/2021	9:00 AM	00325080-000000
5	BPAS-21-53	Morshedi, Christine	76	5/17/2021	9:19 AM	00352890-000000
6	BPAS-21-34	QUINCOSSES FELICIA	74	2/11/2021	9:00 AM	00364370-000000
7	BPAS-07-14	Blue Castle Holdings, LLC	73	2/5/2007	2:10 PM	00353690-000000
8	BPAS-21-64	Bueno Concrete	73	7/8/2021	2:59 PM	00328950-000000
9	BPAS-22-17	KANTHETY SANTOSH	72	6/7/2022	10:06 AM	00360440-000000
10	BPAS-04-93	Borowski, Gregory	71	11/18/2004	8:00 AM	00373010-000000
11	BPAS-21-3	Hole, Cheri	71	4/23/2018	11:22 AM	00331061-000500
12	BPAS-04-49	Hallman, John & Carol	69	8/19/2004	10:48 AM	00365410-000000
13	BPAS-18-39	Epifano, Robert	69	8/3/2018	12:00 PM	00105240-001000
14	BPAS-04-81	Rodriguez, Jose	68	9/7/2004	10:30 AM	00331061-002000
15	BPAS-21-96	Perona, Bernard P.	67	11/28/2005	11:17AM	00320990-000100
16	BPAS-18-44	Firstco Marine LLC	67	12/28/2018	9:55 AM	00347480-000200
17	BPAS-21-30	GEM Homes LLC	67	12/2/2020	10:00 AM	00101340-000000
18	BPAS-21-85	GEM Homes LLC	67	12/2/2020	10:00 AM	00101340-000000
19	BPAS-21-86	GEM Homes LLC	67	12/2/2020	10:00 AM	00101340-000000
20	BPAS-21-87	GEM Homes LLC	67	12/2/2020	10:00 AM	00101340-000000
21	BPAS-21-88	GEM Homes LLC	67	12/2/2020	10:00 AM	00101340-000000
22	BPAS-06-16	Held, Michael & Robin	67	2/14/2006	12:00 PM	00105240-001900
23	BPAS-18-27	4 Avenue D LLC	67	1/16/2018	8:30 AM	00363840-000000
24	BPAS-21-99	4 Avenue D LLC	67	1/16/2018	8:31 AM	00363840-000000
25	BPAS-19-31	The Royal Company	67	7/12/2019	4:57 PM	00104441-000200
26	BPAS-20-27	Corrie, Brent	67	7/6/2020	1:26 PM	00100650-000100
27	BPAS-19-21	JC Construction	66	1/10/2019	2:02 PM	00349970-000000
28	BPAS-21-36	Andrew George	66	2/12/2021	2:22 PM	00376410-000000
29	BPAS-21-70	Cruz in the Keys	66	7/1/2021	2:28 PM	00341930-000000
30	BPAS-21-71	FLORIDA KEYS HOMES	66	7/13/2021	11:29 AM	00376220-000000
31	BPAS-22-22	Cruz, Mildred	66	12/26/2023	4:21 PM	00356740-000000
32	BPAS-04-34	Felling, Michael	65	8/4/2004	3:02 PM	00376160-000000
33	BPAS-18-35	Epifano, Pamela	65	7/13/2018	4:56 PM	00105240-000500
34	BPAS-18-42	Fisher, Aaron	65	12/12/2018	1:30 PM	00354260-000000
35	BPAS-19-30	Guerra, Roger	65	7/15/2019	2:23 PM	00332750-000000
36	BPAS-20-25	Florida Keys Homes LLC	65	6/17/2020	12:00 PM	00354180-000000
37	BPAS-22-16	Miseki, Igor	65	3/23/2022	6:46 PM	00355820-000000
38	BPAS-22-21	McSweeney, Joseph	65	6/7/2022	1:45 PM	00326080-000100
39	BPAS-22-5	Reichert, Timothy	64	1/12/2022	9:10 AM	00333641-009800
40	BPAS-20-28	93 Stirrup Key LLC	64	7/6/2020	4:22 PM	00333641-009300
41	BPAS-21-38	Adkins, Michael	63	7/16/2020	12:46 PM	00373830-000100
42	BPAS-21-100	4 Avenue D LLC	62	1/16/2018	8:32 AM	00363840-000000
43	BPAS-23-10	Palma, Alexander and Angela	61	11/16/2023	9:21 AM	00356690-000000
44	BPAS-06-11	Moreau, Guy	61	1/19/2006	3:00 PM	00329300-000000
45	BPAS-21-26	DESIGN CENTER INC	61	1/15/2021	12:54 PM	00376420-000000
46	BPAS-04-96	Prieto, Rogel	59	12/21/2004	2:21 PM	00328900-000000
47	BPAS-05-47	Forthman, Todd & Leslie	57	10/5/2005	12:30 PM	00339910-000000
48	BPAS-04-52	Mann, James	56	8/9/2004	11:25 AM	00355980-000000
49	BPAS-07-20	Osborne, Robert F	56	3/9/2007	4:40 PM	00319870-000000
50	BPAS-21-101	Osborne, Robert F	56	3/9/2007	4:40 PM	00319870-000000
51	BPAS-07-21	Hetuin, Jean Michael	56	3/9/2007	4:41 PM	00319880-000000
52	BPAS-21-102	Hetuin, Jean Michael	56	3/9/2007	4:41 PM	00319880-000000
53	BPAS-08-3	Torres, Luis & Maria Elena	55	6/3/2008	1:55 PM	00100750-001200
54	BPAS-22-23	Trujillo, Osvaldo	53	9/6/2022	1:20 PM	00322060-000000
55	BPAS-05-38	33 Southpoint, LLC	53	7/13/2005	3:22 PM	00358230-000106
56	BPAS-04-63	Toilton, Frank	52	8/16/2004	8:00 AM	00355418-001800
57	BPAS-08-9	Jutstrom, Bryan	50	3/7/2008	3:50 PM	00345780-000000
58	BPAS-05-25	Valentin, Barbara	47	5/19/2005	4:00 PM	00345570-000000
59	BPAS-13-1	Keys Dragon Marathon	46	1/14/2013	2:00 PM	00102440-000000
60	BPAS-18-28	Vitale, John	45	1/16/2018	8:34 AM	00356720-000000
61	BPAS-19-25	JRC LLC	43	3/22/2019	3:31 PM	00355370-000101
62	BPAS-21-112	Hernandez, Jacqueline	42	11/30/2021	11:05AM	00354430-000000
63	BPAS-16-11	Tatro Michigan, LTD	40	1/11/2016	10:00AM	00355417-003100
64	BPAS-21-104	Waite, Peggy	27	10/20/2021	10:19AM	00375000-000000
65	BPAS-21-105	Waite, Peggy	22	10/20/2021	3:17 PM	00375000-000000
Market Rate Owner Occupied Pool						

Attachment A:
Ranking of BPAS Applications for Period 1 Year 33
July 14, 2024 to January 13, 2025

RANK	ROGO/BPAS NUMBER	NAME	BPAS SCORE	DATE ENTERED	TIME ENTERED	RE NUMBER
1	BPAS-23-9	Muszynski, Olgierd	72	10/16/2023	3:25 PM	00365560-000000
2	BPAS-23-7	Padron, Olga	68	4/17/2023	3:14 PM	00335360-000100
3	BPAS-24-4	Peck, Gloria	65	7/3/2024	1:05 PM	00344170-000000
4	BPAS-22-27	Perez, Luis	61	11/19/2022	9:40 PM	00347440-000000
		<i>Awards</i>	<i>Available</i>	<i>Recommended</i>	<i>Remaining</i>	
		General	2	2	0	
		Owner Occupied	2	2	0	

Any application submitted, perseverance points or changes made after July 13, 2024 will not be reflected on this list.

		AFFORDABLE	YEAR 33	PERIOD 1		
Affordable General Pool						
RANK	ROGO/BPAS NUMBER	NAME	BPAS SCORE	DATE ENTERED	TIME ENTERED	RE NUMBER
1	BPAS-24-1	Joanne Marie GK LLC	63	1/11/2024	3:14 PM	00376320-000000
2	BPAS-24-2	Joanne Marie GK LLC	63	1/11/2024	3:10 PM	00376310-000000
3	BPAS-21-80	GEM Homes	60	12/2/2020	5:04 AM	00101340-000000
4	BPAS-21-81	GEM Homes	60	12/2/2020	5:05 AM	00101340-000000
5	BPAS-21-82	GEM Homes	60	12/2/2020	5:06 AM	00101340-000000
6	BPAS-21-83	GEM Homes	60	12/2/2020	5:07 AM	00101340-000000
7	BPAS-21-84	GEM Homes	60	12/2/2020	5:08 AM	00101340-000000
8	BPAS-21-89	QOF, Inc	42	7/21/2020	9:05 AM	00350630-000000
9	BPAS-21-90	QOF, Inc	42	7/21/2020	9:05 AM	00350630-000000
10	BPAS-21-91	QOF, Inc	42	7/21/2020	9:05 AM	00350630-000000
Community Workforce Housing						
RANK	ROGO/BPAS NUMBER	NAME	BPAS SCORE	DATE ENTERED	TIME ENTERED	RE NUMBER
1	BPAS-22-9	Sexton, Matt	28	2/22/2022	10:28 AM	00371010-000000
2	BPAS-22-10	Sexton, Matt	28	2/22/2022	10:31 AM	00371010-000000
3	BPAS-22-11	Sexton, Matt	28	2/22/2022	10:36 AM	00371010-000000
4	BPAS-22-12	Sexton, Matt	28	2/22/2022	10:38 AM	00371010-000000
5	BPAS-22-13	Sexton, Matt	28	2/22/2022	10:41 AM	00371010-000000
6	BPAS-22-14	Sexton, Matt	28	2/22/2022	10:43 AM	00371010-000000
7	BPAS-22-15	Sexton, Matt	28	2/22/2022	10:46 AM	00371010-000000
8	BPAS-21-111	Sexton, Matt	27	11/25/2021	3:35 PM	00371010-000000
9	BPAS-23-2	Vastola, Jeff	26	1/9/2023	9:46 AM	00375960-000000
10	BPAS-23-3	Vastola, Jeff	26	1/9/2023	9:48 AM	00375960-000000
11	BPAS-23-4	Vastola, Jeff	26	1/9/2023	9:49 AM	00375960-000000
12	BPAS-23-5	Vastola, Jeff	26	1/9/2023	9:50 AM	00375960-000000
TBR Affordable Pool						
RANK	ROGO/BPAS NUMBER	NAME	BPAS SCORE	DATE ENTERED	TIME ENTERED	RE NUMBER
1	BPAS-21-44	Andrew George	43	3/18/2021	10:20 AM	00341720-000000
2	BPAS-21-46	Blanco	43	3/18/2021	11:10 AM	00102830-000401
3	BPAS-21-61	Rice, David and Mary	43	6/28/2021	1:11 PM	00341860-000000
4	BPAS-21-74	Rice, David and Mary	43	6/28/2021	1:11 PM	00341860-000000
5	EE-12	Patrick Stevens	41	12/16/2021	2:07 PM	00371010-000000
6	EE-12	Patrick Stevens	41	12/16/2021	2:07 PM	00371010-000000
7	EE-12	Patrick Stevens	41	12/16/2021	2:07 PM	00371010-000000
8	EE-12	Patrick Stevens	41	12/16/2021	2:07 PM	00371010-000000

RANK	ROGO/BPAS NUMBER	NAME	BPAS SCORE	DATE ENTERED	TIME ENTERED	RE NUMBER
9	EE-12	Patrick Stevens	41	12/16/2021	2:07 PM	00371010-000000
10	EE-12	Patrick Stevens	41	12/16/2021	2:07 PM	00371010-000000
11	EE-12	Patrick Stevens	41	12/16/2021	2:07 PM	00371010-000000
12	EE-12	Patrick Stevens	41	12/16/2021	2:07 PM	00371010-000000
13	BPAS-21-110	Ahearn, Justin	31	11/10/2021	10:05AM	00344270-000000
14	EE-14	Barbara Mitchell	31	7/9/2024	3:17 PM	00102830-000100
15	EE-14	Barbara Mitchell	31	7/9/2024	3:17 PM	00102830-000100
16	EE-14	Barbara Mitchell	31	7/9/2024	3:17 PM	00102830-000100
17	EE-14	Barbara Mitchell	31	7/9/2024	3:17 PM	00102830-000100
18	BPAS-21-47	Cameron	28	3/30/2021	1:11 PM	00350490-000000
19	BPAS-21-48	Cameron	28	3/30/2021	1:11 PM	00350490-000000
20	BPAS-21-49	Cameron	28	3/20/2021	1:11 PM	00350490-000000
21	BPAS-21-54	Matlock	28	4/20/2021	9:00 AM	00338880-000000
22	BPAS-21-55	Matlock	28	4/20/2021	9:00 AM	00333880-000000
23	BPAS-21-56	Griffith	28	6/1/2021	7:56 AM	00320460-000000
24	BPAS-21-57	Griffith	28	6/1/2021	7:56 AM	00320460-000000
25	BPAS-21-58	Griffith	28	6/1/2021	7:56 AM	00320460-000000
26	BPAS-21-59	Griffith	28	6/1/2021	7:56 AM	00320460-000000
27	BPAS-21-40	212 Lindahl LLC-	27	9/21/2020	3:40 PM	00333370-000000
28	BPAS-21-92	212 Lindahl LLC	27	9/21/2020	3:40 PM	00333370-000000
29	BPAS-21-93	212 Lindahl LLC	27	9/21/2020	3:40 PM	00333370-000000
30	BPAS-21-94	212 Lindahl LLC	27	9/21/2020	3:40 PM	00333370-000000
31	BPAS-21-115	Dovelle, Frank	26	12/10/2021	12:37PM	00333520-000000
32	BPAS-21-116	Dovelle, Frank	26	12/10/2021	12:38PM	00333530-000000
		<i>Awards</i>	<i>Available</i>	<i>Recommended</i>	<i>Remaining</i>	
		General	1	1	0	
		Workforce	0	0	0	
		TBR	0	0	0	